Misogynistic Views in Participatory Dictionaries

Çilem Tuğba Koç
Erciyes University Faculty of Communications
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3479-4035
takdag@erciyes.edu.tr

Abstract

Like other forms of marginalization, misogyny feeds on negative stereotypes associated with the targeted group. These stereotypes are dominant in society, perpetuated through discourse, and often perceived as normal. Participatory dictionaries, popular sources of information for people from childhood onward, are one of the platforms where online misogyny is produced. Given the influence of these dictionaries, investigating and revealing misogyny in them may require rethinking and questioning the social assumptions about the female sex in the online environment. Though misogyny does not always result in direct violence, it mentally feeds violence against women. Investigating it in online environments is therefore vital, especially in a world where individuals are increasingly becoming socialized and learning judgments about their sex identities in digital spaces. This study aims to uncover discriminatory and misogynistic discourses against women in participatory dictionaries. For this purpose, its examination is conducted using the oldest and most popular dictionaries in Turkey—namely, Ekşi Sözlük (1999), Instela (2004 at ITU-2015 at Instela), Uludağ Sözlük (2005), and İnci Sözlük (2009). A total of 684 entries containing misogynistic elements under the topic of women are analyzed in this study. In line with the purpose of this study, these entries are analyzed using van Dijk's ideological square technique. Our analysis reveals that discriminatory language is used against women, describing them as creatures or non-human entities through the use of negative adjectives. In addition to direct misogyny, such as insults and belittlement, indirect misogyny is also found among the entries, including victimization and objectification.

Keywords: Gender, misogyny, new media, participatory dictionaries, women's studies.

▪ ▪ ▪ ▪ ▪

Received: 3.3.2023 ▪ Accepted: 26.7.2023

Katılımcı Sözlüklerde Mizojinik Görünümler

Çilem Tuğba Koç
Erciyes Üniversitesi İletişim Fakültesi
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3479-4035
takdag@erciyes.edu.tr

Öz

Kadın düşmanlığı, tıpkı diğer ötekileştirme biçimleri gibi, hedef alınan gruba yönelik, toplumda egemen olan, hatta normal olarak görülen kadın varlığına yönelik olumsuz klişelerinden (stereotiplerden) beslenmekte ve söylem aracılığıyla iletilerek yeniden üretilmektedir. Çevrimiçi kadın düşmanlığının üretildiği alanlardan biri olan Katılımcı Sözlükler, bireylerin çocukluktan itibaren başvurdukları bilgi kaynaklarından biridir. Sözlüklerin etkisi ve yaygınlığı nedeniyle sözlüklerdeki kadın düşmanlığının araştırılması ve ifşa edilmesi, çevrimiçi alanda da kadın cinsiyeti üzerindeki toplumsal kabuller üzerine yeniden düşünmeyi, sorgulamayı gerektiricektir. Doğrudan şiddetle her zaman sonuçlanmasa da kadına yönelik şiddeti zihnen besleyen kadın düşmanlığının çevrimiçi alanlarda da araştırılması, bireylerin giderek daha çok cinsiyet kimliklerine dair yargıları dijital alanlarda öğrenerek toplumsallaştığı bir evrende daha da önemli hale gelmiştir. Bu amaçla, Türkiye'deki en eski ve popüler sözlükler olmaları bakımından Ekşi Sözlük (1999), Instela (2004'te İTÜ-2015'te Instela), Uludağ Sözlük (2005) ve İnci Sözlük (2009) üzerinden bir inceleme yapılmıştır. İncelemeye alınan sözlüklerde, kadın başlığı altındaki mizojinik unsurlar içeren 684 entry incelenmiştir. Çalışmanın amacı doğrultusunda, "kadın" başlığı altındaki entryler, van Dijk'ın ideolojik dördül alan kare tekniğiyle incelenmiştir. İnceleme sonucunda, kadınlara karşı ötekileştirici bir dil kullanıldığı, kadınlardan "yaratık", "varlık" gibi sözcüklerle insandan başka bir türmüş gibi bahsedildiği, kadınları tanımlamak için olumsuz sıfatlara başvurulduğu görülmüştür. Hakarete başvurma, aşağılama vb. doğrudan mizojini ile birlikte kurbanlaştırma, mantığa büründürme gibi dolaylı yoldan da mizojiniye başvurulduğu tespit edilmiştir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Toplumsal cinsiyet, mizojini, yeni medya, katılımcı sözlükler, kadın çalışmaları

▪ ▪ ▪ ▪ ▪

Makale geliş tarihi: 3.3.2023 ▪ Makale kabul tarihi: 26.7.2023

Advancements in internet technology have brought forth diverse interactions in which individuals can express themselves, taking the circulation of language out of the hands of institutionalized media and placing it in the hands of individuals instead.[1] While new media environment provides a means of participation in democracy for the disadvantaged groups who cannot make their voices heard in the society, it has also turned into an environment wherein people are trapped in their own echo chambers, causing polarization, resentment, and hostility toward the other. Castells, noticed the emergence of internet networks during the early stages of the development of Web 2.0 technologies, including blogs, Youtube, Myspace, social media platforms, as the number of users increased (2008, 90). McLuhan's "global village" notion was reformulated by Volkmer as "global communication networks," (2003, 11) refers to a new public discourse. Rather than passively watching, Benkler (2006), claims that these global networks enable people to interact with others by actively participating in the public sphere. As a consequence, it was expected that the democratic environment provided by the internet would give individuals with a platform to construct their own agenda. Participatory dictionaries are a part of the new media environment and offer a chat environment in which people can freely express their ideas by leaving comments on any topic anonymously, regardless of their understanding

•••

1 First draft of this paper was presented on the 11th of February in 2021 at the II. International-World Women Conference, but not fully published for the revision.

or knowledge. While a public contingency is ascribed to participatory dictionaries due to discourses of freedom, the dictionaries are also those areas in which socially produced negative stereotypes circulate through language and discourses.

Clichés that are socially produced and transmitted through language and discourses are stereotypes that shape individuals' ideas about certain events, people or groups, and which shape their attitudes and behaviors. As individuals individuate themselves by socializing, their judgments about women and men are shaped through the repertoire of the society in which they live. Through language, individuals serve to reinforce and normalize prejudices against certain groups and individuals by repeating the stereotypes in their social repertoire. According to Basow (1986), gender stereotypes and clichés are traits, behaviors, and roles that are often classified as "feminine" and "masculine", and are often assigned by members of a particular culture to ascribe behaviors toward both sexes. Gender stereotypes affect our expectations in different areas of daily life. In social life, women are mostly evaluated by their appearance rather than by their achievements, works, or qualifications (Fredrickson and Roberts 1997).

Misogyny is defined in the 1656 edition of the *Oxford English Dictionary* as the hatred or humiliation of women (Holland 2012). Holland has tried to write a history of misogyny and hatred toward women to explore the roots of that hatred and thereby prepare societies to overcome it (2012). Misogyny spans a wide spectrum, from curses written on toilet walls to the frenzy of a serial murderer. Holland (2012) argues that misogyny is based on a fear men have that arises from the differences between themselves and women, as men have considered women as "the other" (non-man) since the very beginning of human history. Misogyny is considered to be a feeling of hostility toward the female gender, the "disgust or hatred" toward women as an undifferentiated social category, or the hatred or contempt for women and girls (Gilmore 2010; Walker 2022). Misogyny is deeply embedded in patriarchal norms and social power structures that create everyday examples of sexism (Manne 2017; Dickel and Evolvi 2022).

In her book *Loving with a Vengeance*, Tania Modelski, an American feminist, argues that the good woman/mother and bad/provocative female characters are ideologically juxtaposed through television series, and that therefore the audience prefers the good mother over the bad women, who is generally constructed as "evil" and/or "the other" through the use of camera tricks.

Comparatively, the man is fictionalized as an insane sex object that is both cursed and forgiven. As stereotypes are socially constructed, when individuals internalize stereotypes they also internalize social values, making stereotypes appear normal and their existence unquestionable (Modleski 2008). The fact that women are valued with their appearance and men are remembered for their achievements is related to gender-specific social stereotypes. In addition to the widespread use of stereotypes in daily life through language, frequent use of these stereotypes in media contents normalizes gender stereotypes.

A Short History of Gender and New Media

As computers and networked technology take center stage as mainstays of globalization and macroeconomic change, the view that professions related to information processing belong to men has become increasingly prolific in areas such as advertising, software design, hacking, and video games. The software and computer games of the 1980s were dominated by highly sexualized depictions of women, along with themes of militarism and male violence (Lien 2013). As novels, movies, and television often portray men who break through barriers and assert their will using advanced weapons, popular culture increasingly reduces women to the role of objects, and thus high technology has become increasingly fetishistic (Gibson 1994). Since the mid-1980s, there has been a significant decline in female enrollment in computer science courses, causing female participation to fall in computer industries across the world (Wilson 2003). According to Cockburn and Ormrod (1993, 203), extreme gender discrimination at schools and job markets, as well as the prevalence of different role models propounding men as strong, dexterous, and technologically equipped and women as physically and technically incompetent, have caused women to sacrifice important aspects of their feminine identity in order to increase their involvement in technical fields. Felstead et al. (2007) reveal that men are more likely to be involved in jobs involving the use of complex and advanced computers or computer-based equipment, and that women are largely excluded from technical design processes (Felstead et al. 2007; Wajcman 2010). Feminist studies dealing with sexism in the field of science and technology that focus on women's access to and use of technology has shifted toward studies that examine how gender is constructed within technologies. In particular, the way technology reflects gender differences and inequalities is discussed in feminist literature. Feminist studies have begun to examine not only the monopoly of men in technology, but also the way gender is embedded in technology itself (Wajcman 2010, 145).

By the 1990s, feminist studies began to take a close interest in the power of new media as an alternative tool for networking the activities of women's groups. Efforts by female feminist groups to break the monopoly of men in employment areas requiring technical expertise and to increase autonomy and technical competence have come to the fore. The importance of the internet for women's activism was clearly understood by the time of the 1995 Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing. At the end of the conference, the importance of the use of internet technologies was emphasized, ensuring that messages concerning women's issues would be transmitted from first-hand narratives without being dependent on the mainstream media and without the selection and publication of that media. The conference also expressed the importance of using this new tool as an alternative space for women's groups was also expressed (Pollock and Sutton 1999, 83). Feminist groups have effectively used this new tool to quickly reach and organize wide masses. Thanks to the global network, feminism has managed to gather supporters from all over the world and has introduced women's issues to the world agenda. As digital activism of these groups has strengthened in new media, so feminist activism is strengthened its effect and influence on governments.

New media allows individuals to interact with others and causes the spread of extremist, racist, and misogynistic groups. Borum (2011) stated that communities such as these can foster the formation of subcultures in which individuals can develop a common value system for justifying various deviant or criminal activities. Evidence of subcultures directly targeting women in modern society are increasing (Dragiewicz 2008; Gotell and Dutton 2016). These groups have emerged partially from online forums and communities that promote anti-feminist beliefs and the need to protect men's rights, particularly in the context of divorce and parenting decisions (Gotell and Dutton 2016). Diverse beliefs expressed by participants in forums and social media, whether due to a political, religious or racial reason, encourage the use of violence to achieve their goals (Holt et al. 2017).

Features of the internet, such as being anonymous, global, and transnational, allowing for rapid interaction, and bringing together people with similar ideas through algorithms, make it easier for hate speech to spread (Brown 2018). Therefore, it is argued that extremist groups were among the first to adopt the internet because they can more easily find like-minded people, avoid censorship, and spread verbal violence (Gerstenfeld et al. 2003). The perceived safety of online spaces also allows individuals to express

ideas that they cannot share in public due to fear of social rejection or a lack of shared values in physical peer networks (Holt et al. 2017). One of these subgroups mentioned above is misogyny, popularized by spreading through networks under anti-feminism. Popular misogyny is often intertwined with "lad cultures", a collective mindset, and a culture of hyper-masculine that promotes male bonding and tends to view women as sexualized objects (Phipps et al. 2018). While lad cultures are evident in offline contexts, it reveals toxic forms of anti-feminism that have increasingly developed on social media and are gaining ground in the online manosphere (Farrell et al. 2019; Maaranen and Tienari 2020).

Popular Misogyny Online

According to Wrisley (2021), while misogyny refers to negative feelings or emotional orientations toward women as a group, sexism is an institutionalized expression of misogyny on individual issues such as the systematic action of prejudice and discrimination, lower wages for women, and comprehensive reproductive health. According to Anderson (2014), sexism emerges in two forms, as hostility to women or as benevolent sexism. Hostile sexism stems from apparent hostile feelings toward women, particularly negative feelings toward women who do not conform to traditional gender stereotypes. Hostile sexism seeks to legitimize male power, traditionalize gender roles, and the exploitation of women by men as sexual objects through derogatory characterizations. Additionally, benevolent sexism includes behaviors toward women that seem positive but are actually domineering and treat women as relatively powerless. Benevolent sexists characterize women as pure creatures who need protection from men, reflecting the view that women should be loved by men and that they are necessary creatures for the completion of men.

Wrisley (2021) conducted an analysis of misogyny and pointed out that since misogyny is an emotion involving hatred toward women, emotions such as fear, love, desire, shame, and disgust can also be directed at women (Nussbaum 2003). Wrisley (2021) offers a comprehensive feminist discussion of misogyny and argues that, when women do not conform to patriarchal ideology, misogyny in action, such as sexual assault, harassment, intimate partner violence, strangulation, and femicide, cannot be understood with hate speech alone, misogyny is also associated with the idea that women deserve to be mistreated and morally inferior.

By examining the period of Western Neoliberalism's rising right-wing

governments between 2007 and 2018, Bratich and Banet-Weiser (2019) not that violence against women, immigrants, people of color, and refugees has increased dramatically, and emphasize that misogynistic groups organized online felt their masculinity threatened and united in blaming women. Self-confidence guru teachings for men who are fueled by the capitalist ideology have created a mass misogyny through online communities, retargeting women as the victims of violence in a powerful way.

Maxwell et al. (2020) examined the shared experiences, comments, and expressions of users on the Reddit, a popular misogynistic manosphere platform, by analyzing 834 comments under the top 100 posts. Through thematic analysis, the researchers identified two female prototypes, "Femoid" and "Stacy", juxtaposed against a masculine male prototype known as "Chad". Based on the comments made at the end of the study, being an "incel" (meaning an involuntarily celibate) was positioned against other men called "normal". According to the comments analyzed in the study, Stacy represents a physically attractive woman (not overweight and possessing feminine charm) who is interested in men with physical strength, money, and status. Comparatively, Femoids are depicted as unattractive women who indoctrinate girls with anti-male sentiments to keep incels single. In contrast to incel, Chads are socially approved as the ideal partner due to their power and status in society. Another notable aspect of this study was that incel commentators rejected conformity to the physical attractiveness standards imposed by the patriarchal capitalist system for an ideal male; they nevertheless desired Stacy-like women who conformed to society's imposed beauty standards. A further important point made in the study was that incel commentators reduced women to an objectified status by ranking their traditional attractiveness on a point scale in response to their own experienced social and romantic rejection.

Another study examined online incel communities as a subculture and linked the reasons for misogyny expressed in their comments to three main justifications. First, men are oppressed under the power of modern women in the current social system. Second, the belief in women's inherent evil is rooted in their biological nature. Third, pressure is exerted on men by the capitalist system's emphasis on physical attractiveness for both men and women (O'Malley et al. 2022). All of these justifications have been found to legitimize general hostility toward society and hatred and violence toward women (O'Malley et al. 2022). Masculine identity is considered a significant source of tension guiding the formation of online anti-women subcultures.

While femininity is considered as a permanent biological maturity function (puberty), masculinity is perceived as a highly specific set of features, behaviors, and responsibilities that are difficult to achieve, easily lost, and that are often under threat. Therefore, masculinity is deemed as an insecure social status that is both hard-won and precarious (Bosson et al. 2006).

Methods

Unlike other studies, the present study searched for the traces of "misogyny" in the entries of male authors who do not define themselves as "incel" or "misogynist", under the entry "what is a woman?" Therefore, this study aims to reveal how misogyny is produced and legitimized through new media, not only through feminism but also through sexist stereotypes against women. 474 pages were examined for this purpose: 270 pages in Ekşisözlük, 90 pages in Instela, 19 pages in İncisözlük, 95 pages in Uludağsözlük, under the title of women. Each page was imported into the Maxqda Analytics Pro 22 computer software program, used to perform qualitative analysis via the import web pages tab by URL. In accordance with the sampling frame, the aim was to examine the misogynistic elements in the cited pages and to focus on the negative entries under the title of "women" and the comments of the dictionary authors. A total of 5,955 entries were reviewed under the title of "women in the participatory dictionaries" and 684 entries having misogynous features were investigated. Both features were preferred as the units of analysis.

According to van Dijk (1993), critical discourse analysis examines the discourse in which unequal and unfair power and power relations are misused in the language used therein. Critical discourse analysts study how inequality and domination are re-established through discourse in daily life. In this sense, topics related to immigrants, refugees, and male dominance are suitable for critical discourse analysis. In this study, a critical discourse analysis was conducted to reveal how male dominant discourse is constructed in participatory dictionaries that emerge as a male universe in new media. Definitions of the "other" may be roughly racist or carry hidden negative ideas about refugees. In addition to qualifying them, conservative speakers will typically reverse this role for in-group members when in-group and out-group polarization defines our own people as victims. Ideological analysis begins with the definition of the actors by themselves. The actors are addressed as group members or individuals in terms of their supposed qualities, positions, or relationships with other people (van Dijk 1993). The main reason to focus only on male user comments in the study is to reveal

the sexist discourse containing hostility harbored by men within the general population. Therefore, how male users praise themselves and denigrate "women" in their discourses as the other, and how they refer to and generalize them as a group, was examined using van Dijk's ideological square technique.

Considering the dictionary entries, it was found that male dictionary authors use a first person plural (we) when talking about their same sex, and a third person plural (they) when talking about the opposite sex. In this respect, instead of syntactic analysis such as the active passive, this study considered the language of "us" and "them" that are used by male users to marginalize women. van Dijk (1993) refers to the discourses of "us" and "them" considered within the scope of strategies such as victimization, authority, traditional theme, classification, comparison, political strategy, denial, distancing, dramatization, empathy, euphemism, heredity, explanation, reasoning, generalization, exaggeration, and irony. Among these strategies, since the male authors use traditional themes, victimization, classification, and rationalization, several of these strategies were placed in the coding scheme by considering those codes that were to be extracted from the texts. It was observed that gender-specific stereotypes for the female gender were used in the entries analyzed. The codes of women's maternal role and women's nature were examined under the main code of invoking the traditional theme. Considering the examined texts, several sub-categories, such as the educational role of mothers, the idea of women being blessed with motherhood, and the glorification of motherhood, were identified under the under the identity of motherhood. In addition, several sub-codes, such as the depiction of women as devils or angels, being emotional, being beautiful, being stylish and well-groomed, and being aesthetically and sexually attractive were reached under the code of women's nature.

Among those entries taken for analysis, it was observed that misogyny is produced in two ways: directly and indirectly. It was determined that several insults describing women and several diverse expressions degrading the female gender were used, and that women were also defined as the enemies of men. Since there was no implicit expression on the discourse, these themes were directly placed in the code system as sub-codes of misogyny. In addition, it was understood that women were also classified as "Kezban" (female name with a negative connotation) and that men resorted to victimization to try and demonstrate that the innocent party in male-female romantic relationships was that of men, therefore placing misogyny on ostensibly logical grounds. These

themes were indirectly determined as sub-codes of the code of misogyny.

The study had used two types of coding. First, several keywords such as devil/angel, beautiful, well-groomed, ugly, stupid, smart, motherhood were determined, and phrase and sentence groups were automatically coded to determine the gender stereotypes that would fall under the traditional theme within the texts. Sentence groups that were irrelevant and would fall under a separate code were distinguished within the automatic coding. Secondly, manual coding was carried out on all of the entries examined. To help the second researcher conduct the coding, code definitions were made for each code using the memolink. The rate of intercoder reliability between the researchers was found to be 95%.

Invoking the Traditional Theme

In the participatory dictionaries, misogyny is fed by the stereotypes about gender toward women. Therefore, gender stereotypes were examined under the strategy of invoking the traditional theme. As a result of the coding, stereotypes about women were used under four main headings. Among these stereotypes within the analyzed texts, personality traits claimed to exist in women and generalized to all women were identified in 69 comments, stereotypes based on women's physical characteristics such as being stylish, well-groomed, and attractive and beautiful, were identified in 138 comments, stereotypes about women's maternal identity were identified in 124 comments, and stereotypes about women being innocent or evil were identified in 97 comments. In some comments, women's personal and biological characteristics, such as being jealous, talking a lot, and being irritable were attributed to hormonal changes in their body. In addition to binary comparisons of women such as ugly–beautiful and "blonde" fool–clever, women were expressed with negative adjectives such as selfish, self-interested, unfaithful, unreliable, greedy, capricious, humorless, vengeful, and unsympathetic.

In the participatory dictionary entries analyzed in this study, it was stated that women are useless without their sexual organs, that they were created as a subspecies of men, and that they are simple, low-capacity primate, and humanoid creatures. Both misogynistic and insulting expressions were used to describe women in the dictionaries. Several insulting expressions were used in the analyzed entries, including "God-given awkwardness", "the creature using crying as a weapon", "selfish", "chatterer", "parasitic", "crazy", "petticoat", "lower model of man, upper model of monkey", "the kind that

was born to drive men crazy", "unreliable", "food processor" and "TV remote without a mute button". As a result of the coding, it was found that the two most dominant features among these adjectives attributed to women were emotionality and jealousy. In those entries made under the title of women, the emotional nature of women was mentioned in 27 comments and their jealousy in 13 comments, wherein the jealousy of women was referred to the jealousy of both men and women.

In the entries it was stated that, because women have low self-confidence and do not love themselves, they may be jealous of anything desirable that they do not possess, such as beauty, success, social status, youth, money, and power. In addition, several entries also emphasized that women cannot really love anyone and that therefore they are unreliable. It was also stated that women do not pursue happiness but instead aim only to show off. In the examined forums, it was observed that the stereotypes of men being physically strong and women being fragile and therefore emotional are also reflected in line with social stereotypes toward women and men prevalent in society. It was emphasized that emotionality is brought by the biological nature of women, and that by using the sensuality of women, men could make women do whatever they want. Among the entries assessed in this study, the emotional nature of women has been evaluated as a weakness of women. It was also claimed that women can never think clearly because they are emotional, and many comments stated that women use their emotionality as a manipulation tool to influence men.

In addition, it was observed by the researchers that another traditional theme regarding the nature of women is used in stereotypes based on the physical characteristics of women, such as being stylish, well-groomed, attractive, and beautiful. Under the title of woman, it was found that women were mostly defined by the word beautiful (in a total of 94 entries), followed by attractive (30 entries), sexually attractive (16 entries), and stylish and well-groomed (14 entries). In those entries that emphasized the beauty of women, women were considered beautiful because of their physical appearance, including having a more aesthetically beautiful body than men. In some comments, women's beauty was considered a gift to men in order to make men's lives life more beautiful, while other comments portrayed women's beauty, attractiveness, and charm as dangerous to men. Some of the comments advised that men should simultaneously be afraid and even stay away from women who are beautiful and intelligent.

It was observed the researchers that the capitalist patriarchal discourse that women should be beautiful and attractive, and this sentiment was also found to dominate the language used in the entries. In the entries it was stated that women gain social value depending on several qualities such as being stylish and well-groomed, making men pursue them romantically, smelling good, being blonde, wearing make-up, wearing high heels, and being aesthetically attractive. In the entries, women are also defined as supra-male beings that can walk around in the office with sundress in winter and a roll neck top and jacket in summer. In the entries, being young was considered one of the most important elements that adds attractiveness and value to women. Comparatively, it was stated in the entries that men are not subject to such a classification, while women's attractiveness has been categorized by age.

The third traditional theme related to women concerns the identity of motherhood, and that, since women both give birth to and raise men, they are valued with the role of motherhood; they are defined as sacred beings as they carry the genetics of the Turkish lineage and as creatures who create human beings with their body and who can become mothers. It was stated that mothers shape society through the individuals they help to raise, and that therefore only women can only raise men who respect women. On analysis of the entries, it was observed that both motherhood and women who can bear children were sanctified in the language used. It has been claimed in the entries that women who cannot become mothers are therefore useless, that women gain value only through motherhood, and that women who cannot become mothers will go insane later in life due to their hormones. In addition, it was also stated in the entries that women can get rid of their poor qualities only when they become mothers, by destroying their jealousy, selfishness, infidelity, cruelty, lying, and by being greedy, which are identified with and claimed to be fundamental to the nature of women.

> Without exception, they all want men with money. She expects everything from a man, let him ask her out and be the first to remember special days and buy gifts. She thinks herself holy just because she is strong-willed. Those who can be mothers are sacred. War comes out of two things in life; money and women […] Spend a week at most; more will ruin both of you (@prensipleriolanadam, December 29, 2015).

It was also observed that the most common stereotype regarding gender used in the analyzed entries was the "angel/devil" stereotype. The language used regarding the identity and existence of women tried to place women

within a narrow dichotomy as being either "innocent" through "angelization" or as "unpredictable/untrustworthy" demonic entities that "deceive men". In the entries, although women are described as "innocent" for reasons such as self-sacrifice, being a mother, and being full of love, they are also often portrayed as "devils", with several negative descriptions, such as the devil's soldier, the devil's caliph, one who plays both sides against the middle, one who is in league with the devil, and as owners of original sin. In addition, women were presented as the source of strife and mischief, as being more inclined to evil than men, and as taking advantage of men by using their own weaknesses. Women were described in 39 comments as being strange to understand, strange, unclear regarding what they wanted, and the most difficult and complex creature in the world.

> My mother used to warn me all the time not to lie to women, 'Look, son, don't lie to women and deceive them' […] Time passed and she would add, 'Look, baby, don't believe women, there's a devil hanging from every strand of their hair (@ ocean ocean, August 25, 2013).

As a result, it was observed that some of the stereotypes attributed to women by society are repeated in the participatory dictionaries assessed in this study. Considering the female gender, many arguments, such as the physical weakness of women, their inability to drive automobiles well, their pursuit of rich men, and their use of sexual attraction to seduce men, in parallel with the traditional way of thinking in society, were used to humiliate the female gender. Several traits such as childishness, clumsiness, emotionality, jealousy and marriage lover were also observed as being attributed to women in the dictionary entries, thereby showing that their authors resorted to traditional themes of the female gender. A common male discourse has emerged that women should be avoided through descriptions specific to women's nature, such as having intelligence and beauty, being associated with the devil, and having an unreliable nature. Men's efforts to understand or define women have turned into a kind of fear of women.

Direct/Indirect Recourse to Misogyny

Considering the entries under the heading of women, hostility toward women emerged in two forms: directly and indirectly. An examination of the texts used in this study revealed that that women were directly insulted in 26 comments, that hostile expressions were used against women in 22 comments, and that women were directly humiliated without any categorization or

comparison in eight comments. It was also observed that humiliations against women were made only due to qualities claimed by the entry authors as being specific to women. Women were also expressed as being vile, bad, dirty, filthy, chatterboxes, greedy, and incompletely intelligent beings.

> The 2nd class woman adores money so much that when she gets the chance, she can forget even her values such as motherhood and companionship (which is actually a duty given to the mother by nature) that she uses to cover up her vile dirty and evil spirit. For the 2nd class women, motherhood can get rid of her honorable behaviors such as a good companion (not in an honorable situation, but a duty given by nature only) without losing any time, and it can even turn into a despicable, unclean and bad spiritually corrupted entity. We also understand from this that the 2nd class woman is a vile, dirty and evil being instead of having the good qualities such as motherhood and honor (@kuba ulku ocaklari, March 10, 2012).

In the entries, it was determined that women were defined and insulted through reference to their genitals and are considered immoral, disgusting, useless, unqualified, and parasitic creatures. Considering the insults to women used in the entries, women were found to be generally insulted because they are prudish, want to dominate men, and because they aim to take advantage of men's money. As another striking feature in the entries, similar to the results of the studies on incel men (Farrell et al. 2019; Gotell and Dutton 2016; Maxwell et al. 2020; O'Malley et al., Holt 2022), diverse insults and hostile expressions were used against women who rejected men because they did not want to have a premarital relationship with them. In the entries, several clichés of women suggesting that women should be at home and do not know how to drive have been used together with hostile expressions toward women. Women were shown to be targets through the use of statements denigrating them as a group through direct hatred, grudges, and hostility, which furthermore suggested that women deserve all kinds of maltreatment.

> The women I mistreated all liked me, such a different mob. If you are a good guy, then the problem is that you. Don't treat them well, when you treat women well, they turn into a Kezban, but when you treat them badly, they turn into angels. Let's spread this certain information (@quoth the raven acid, January 20, 2016).

Several direct misogynistic elements and an indirect hostility toward women were found in the entries. One of the most striking examples among the definitions of woman under the title of woman in the entries was that the

woman was defined using diverse negative words, apart from the definition of woman as another gender of human being. Considering those terms chosen to describe women the descriptions used in 47 comments include such diverse words as being, creature, living thing, name, life-form, and as a "cat-like being, complex creature, name given to helpless assets, unqualified low live, the world's emptiest race, incomprehensible life form". A categorization has been made about women under the name "Kezban", a female name, as one of the stereotypes for Turkish women. Therefore, a coding was made under the name of Kezban. Women were mentioned under the name of Kezban in a total of 18 comments. According to the dictionary authors, Kezban is depicted as an ugly woman who, as a result of her mother's guidance, does not have a relationship with someone before marriage, considers men as marriageable prey, and whose main purpose is to subjugate men.

> The extreme type of Kezo are those with hairy arms. Come on, if a Kezban is beautiful, you can put up with her to a certain extent, yes, I'm sincere, there are such beautiful Kezbans (usually they talk like children) that you can put up with her to a certain extent, but those with hairy arms are Kezbans who live with learned helplessness. They are not beautiful but they think that they are princesses with an unnecessary arrogance with the flattery of older men and their mothers (@turtelscanfly, May 8, 2013).

In addition to the classification of women under the name of Kezban, another categorization was made about women in 23 comments. It was observed in the entries assessed in this study that binary stereotypes suitable for traditional discourse such as stupid–clever, beautiful–ugly, moral–immoral, well-groomed–plain, goddess–mop, intellectual–marriage freak were used to categorize women. An assessment of the entries also revealed that women were classified as money-hungry, nagging, forgetful, complex, and humanoid. The most dominant categorization of women was that of "beautiful or ugly", which is based on their appearance.

> It is obvious that this race, which has weak friendship relations, has some cruel friend criteria. Every woman has a lot of close friends, bros, sweethearts whom she only believes to be ugly, but she tends to think that all girls other than her are stupid and gossipy whores. This is because these women, who are rivals in the natural environment, can only be found in her environment if they are considered to be less attractive than her. This is why the perfect and exceptional female subspecies, whose best friends are men, has been formed, in my opinion (@limon kimyon zorro, February 7, 2013).

Another categorization of women in the dictionary entries was about the age of women. According to the coding carried out in this study, it was determined that women were classified according to their age in a total of seven comments. Accordingly, women who do not know themselves very well at a young age and who become attractive for a relationship in middle age were therefore said to fall into the category of good wives and mothers after middle age. Along with this categorization of women according to age, the interest of men in women was also categorized according to age. It was stated in the assessed dictionary entries that men's interest in women will decrease as women age. It was stated that most women are gold diggers and consider men as a trinket they can marry, especially after their 30s. While women are limited according to different age ranges, one entry argued that women will gain value as they age by making an ironic statement that a 70-year-old woman has a "glorious past" like Turkey.

> A woman aged between 15 and 25 years is like Africa, half discovered, half virgin.
> A woman aged between 25 and 35 years is like America, completely discovered and scientifically perfect.
> A woman aged between 35 and 45 years is like India and Japan, very hot, wise and beautiful.
> A woman aged between 45 and 55 years is like France, war-damaged but still attractive.
> A woman aged between 55 and 60 years is like Germany, lost the war, but has hope.
> A woman aged between 60 and 70 years is like Russia, wide, quiet but no one visits.
> A woman older than 70 years is like Turkey, a glorious past but no future.. (@ antagonistanbul, January 30, 2015).

Another important discourse regarding women in participatory dictionaries considers women as being perilous due to their unknown nature. Therefore, men are instructed to stay away from women and to be wary of them, even to the point of never trusting them. The unknown nature of women was mentioned in 42 comments in the analyzed texts. Obscurity and dangerous natures of women are expressed using several words such as "strange, complex, dark continent". It was stated that men should be afraid of women because women are unpredictable. The complexity of the nature of women was presented as the reason behind their unreliability, with women being presented as sometimes mysterious, sometimes demonic, and sometimes irrational beings.

> There are various theories about whether women are part of the human species, or whether machines created by God. They have complications and functions. The woman is the general name given to living things that are emotional beings with a fast jaw structure, long hair, capable of giving birth to children, formerly owned by bride price, for whose sake songs can be written and sung, who can make men crawl, have invisible weapons, are called virgins before marriage, still exists in types that can also function as dishwashers and washing machines, are skilled in cooking, are identified with the secretarial profession, and have many varieties in themselves such as mother-sister-crush-wife (@piremit, January 4, 2009).

Finally, it was observed in the assessed entries that men produce a discourse by presenting themselves as victims, making themselves victims and thereby rationalizing their hostility toward women. In the entries examined, misogyny was rationalized in eight comments and this rationalization is based on three main claims. First, that women dominate men because women are very smart and beautiful and that they can make men do whatever they want, but that they will ultimately and cruelly leave men because women cannot be happy. Second, that it is useless to defend women since women never support their own gender. Third, men do not consider women as pieces of meat, but women deserve to be treated as pieces of meat because they reveal themselves through their sexuality. An analysis of the misogyny rationalized in the analyzed texts revealed that a total of 16 comments suggested that women are never victimized and that, on the contrary, men are victimized because of women: "Women are human beings tasked with persecuting men. They play with our pure feelings in such a way that we become so brainless that we believe in them every time" (@navalboy, March 27, 2012).

In summary, it was determined that several stereotypes related to gender are produced in the entries under the title of women among those participant dictionaries analyzed in this study, and that these stereotypes are produced through the use of discriminatory language against women in order to define them with negative qualifications, to describe the existence/identity of women through the female genitals, to value women through beauty and attractiveness, and to emphasize that the purpose of women's existence is to please and serve men. In the entries, it was also stated that women can rid themselves of their position as the inferior sex and be valued in the society only when they gain the identity of "motherhood" and that women are incomprehensible, unpredictable beings who should be managed by men.

Discussion

In the dictionary entries under the title of women, it was found that the authors both reflected stereotypes about gender and women from the past but also reproduced such stereotypes by using them in daily life. In parallel to social judgment, the woman is identified with the mother, and it was mentioned that women can only rid themselves of their ostensibly bad nature if they become a mother. The nature of women has been defined by several expressions with negative adjectives such as evil, incomprehensible, greedy, liar, unreliable, jealous, and overly emotional. It was found that the name Kezban was used to describe unattractive women, as compared with the use of Stacy (Maxwell et al. 2020), which is used by incels to describe beautiful women. In the assessed entries, Kezban was also defined as a woman who refuses to have sex with a man before marriage, is marriage freak, careless, and an undesirable woman. The authors of the entries analyzed in this study defined women according to maternal roles or the female genitals. It was determined that idealized beauty from the perspective of capitalist ideology is processed as the reason for women's love. Although the stereotype of a blonde stupid–sexy woman was not mentioned, normal intelligence and beautiful women were considered acceptable in the analyzed texts. Comparatively, the intelligent and beautiful woman is mentioned as an object of fear, threatening the existence of men and trying to take away male dominance. Women have been classified according to both their age and their being evil/innocent.

The entries used a marginalizing discourse toward women, and women were also marginalized as a non-human species through the use of words such as "being", "creature", and "race". The entries assessed also emphasized the unknowable and unpredictable nature of women, and also stated that women never deserve true love; they deserve ill-treatment as their unpredictability will result in them leaving or cheating on men. It was claimed that men are victims and the innocent party in male–female romantic relationships as women will piteously deceive and abandon men. According to an analysis of the entries, it can be said that, although each author describes their own subjective experience, they nevertheless reach the common opinion that women are their enemies. Re-circulating this misogynistic discourse that is interwoven with stereotypes about gender in participatory dictionaries will cause the generation who grew up with these dictionaries to be misogynistic starting from an early age.

Developments in the means of communication are seen as a technological

revolution (Benkler 2006; Castells 2008). Along with the emergence of new media, the audience has turned into a content producer. Accordingly, there has been an emergence of discussions in public spaces where everyone can participate collectively. From personal blogs to social media and participatory dictionaries, users have found the opportunity to express their opinions freely within the new media ecosystem. As Volkmer (2003) claims, new media, regarded as a tool for democratic participation, is defined as a space where individuals interact in a global network. It was imagined that parties and opinions that could not find a place in traditional media could speak out through this new media – becoming a space that would protect the rights of disadvantaged groups, serve in their favor, and be a true alternative to the traditional media. However, the new media environment, shaped within the capitalist discourse in global circulation, has turned into a space where images of capitalist ideology regarding women and men, discrimination, and hate speech are in circulation. Participatory dictionaries, which are part of the new media environment, have come to the fore as one of the places where discrimination against women, sexism, and misogynistic discourses are produced.

References

Anderson, Kristin J. 2014. *Modern Misogyny: Anti-Feminism in a Post-Feminist Era.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Basow, Susan A. 1986. *Gender Stereotypes: Traditions and Alternatives.* Monterey, California: Brooks/Cole Publishing Company.

Benkler, Yochai. 2006. *The Wealth of Networks: How Social Production Transforms Markets and Freedom*. New Heaven & London: Yale University Press. https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt1njknw

Borum, Randy. 2011. "Radicalization Into Violent Extremism II: A Review of Conceptual Models and Empirical Research." *Journal of Strategic Security* 4 (4): 37-62. https://dx.doi.org/10.5038/1944-0472.4.4.2.

Bosson, Jennifer K., Jenel N. Taylor and Jennifer L. Prewitt-Freilino. 2006. "Gender Role Violations and Identity Misclassification: The Roles of Audience and Actor Variables." *Sex Roles* 55 (1): 13-24. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11199-006-9056-5.

Bratich, Jack and Sarah Banet-Weiser. 2019. "From Pick-Up Artists to Incels: Con(fidence) Games, Networked Misogyny, and the Failure of Neoliberalism." *International Journal of Communication* 13: 5003-5027.

Brown, Alexander. 2018. "What is so Special about Online (As Compared to Offline) Hate Speech?." *Ethnicities* 18 (3): 297-326. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468796817709846.

Castells, Manuel. 2008. "The New Public Sphere: Global Civil Society, Communication Networks, and Global Governance." *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 616 (1): 78-93.

Cockburn, Cynthia and Susan Ormrod. 1993. *Gender and Technology in the Making*. Londra, Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Dickel, Valerie and Giulia Evolvi. 2022. "'Victims of Feminism': Exploring Networked Misogyny and #MeToo in the Manosphere." *Feminist Media Studies* 23 (4): 1-17. https://doi.org/10.1080/14680777.2022.2029925.

Dragiewicz, Molly. 2008. "Patriarchy Reasserted: Fathers' Rights and Anti-VAWA Activism." *Feminist Criminology* 3 (2): 121-144.

Farrell, Tracie, Miriam Fernandez, Jakub Novotny and Harith Alani. 2019. "Exploring Misogyny across the Manosphere in Reddit." *WebSci'19:Proceedings of the 10th ACM Conference on Web Science*, 30 June- 3 July, USA. 87-96. https://doi.org/10.1145/3292522.3326045.

Felstead, Alan, Duncan Gallie, Francis Green and Ying Zhou. 2007. *Skills at Work, 1986-2006*. Oxford: ESRC Centre on Skills, Knowledge and Organisational Performance.

Fredrickson, Barbara L. and Tomi-Ann Roberts. 1997. "Objectification Theory: Toward Understanding Women's Lived Experiences and Mental Health Risks." *Psychology of Women Quarterly* 21 (2): 173-206. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-6402.1997.tb00108.x.

Gerstenfeld, Phyllis B., Diana R. Grant and Chau-Pu Chiang. 2003. "Hate Online: A Content Analysis of Extremist Internet Sites." *Analyses of Social Issues and Public Policy* 3 (1): 29-44. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1530-2415.2003.00013.x.

Gibson, James William. 1994. *Warrior Dreams: Violence and Manhood in Post-Vietnam America*. New York: Hill and Wang.

Gilmore, David D. 2010. *Misogyny: The Male Malady*. Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Gotell, Lise and Emily Dutton. 2016. "Sexual Violence in the 'Manosphere': Antifeminist Men's Rights Discourses on Rape." *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy* 5 (2): 65-80. https://doi.org/10.5204/ijcjsd.v5i2.310.

Holland, Jack. 2012. *A Brief History of Misogyny: The World's Oldest Prejudice*. London: Robinson Little, Brown Book Group.

Holt, Thomas J., Joshua D. Freilich and Steven M. Chermak. 2017. "Internet-Based Radicalization as Enculturation to Violent Deviant Subcultures." *Deviant Behavior* 38 (8): 855-869. https://doi.org/10.1080/01639625.2016.1197704.

Lien, Tracey. 2013. "No Girls Allowed: Unraveling the Story Behind the Stereotype of Video Games Being for Boys." *Polygon*, 2 December 2013. https://www.polygon.com/features/2013/12/2/5143856/no-girls-allowed.

Maaranen, Anna and Janne Tienari. 2020. "Social Media and Hyper-Masculine Work Cultures." *Gender, Work & Organization* 27 (6): 1127-1144. https://doi.org/10.1111/gwao.12450.

Manne, Kate. 2017. *Down Girl: The Logic of Misogyny*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Maxwell, December, Sarah R. Robinson, Jessica R. Williams and Craig Keaton. 2020. "'A Short Story of a Lonely Guy': A Qualitative Thematic Analysis of Involuntary Celibacy Using Reddit." *Sexuality & Culture* 24 (6): 1852-1874. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12119-020-09724-6.

Modleski, Tania. 2008. *Loving with a Vengeance: Mass Produced Fantasies for Women*. New York & London: Routledge.

Nussbaum, Martha C. 2003. *Upheavals of Thought: The Intelligence of Emotions*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

O'Malley, Roberta Liggett, Karen Holt and Thomas J. Holt. 2022. "An Exploration of the Involuntary Celibate (Incel) Subculture Online." *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 37 (7-8): 4981-5008. https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260520959625.

Phipps, Alison, Jessica Ringrose, Emma Renold and Carolyn Jackson. 2018. "Rape Culture, Lad Culture and Everyday Sexism: Researching, Conceptualizing and Politicizing New Mediations of Gender and Sexual Violence." *Journal of Gender Studies* 27 (1): 1-8. https://doi.org/10.1080/09589236.2016.1266792.

Pollock, Scarlet and Jo Sutton. 1999. "Women Click: Feminism and." In *Cyberfeminism: Connectivity, Critique and Creativity*, edited by Susan Hawthorne and Renate Klein, 33-51. Melbourne: Spinifex Press Pty Ltd.

Walker, Rachel L. 2022. "Call It Misogyny." *Feminist Theory* 0 (0): 1-19. https://doi.org/ 10. 1177/14647001221119995.

van Dijk, Teun A. 1993. "Principles of Critical Discourse Analysis." *Discourse & Society* 4 (2): 249-283. https://doi.org/10.1177/0957926593004002006.

Volkmer, Ingrid. 2003. "The Global Network Society and the Global Public Sphere." *Development* 46: 9-16. https://doi.org/10.1177/101163700304600 1566.

Wajcman, Judy. 2010. "Feminist Theories of Technology." *Cambridge Journal of Economics* 34 (1): 143-152.

Wilson, Fiona. 2003. "Can Compute, won't Compute: Women's Participation in the Culture of Computing". *New Technology, Work and Employment* 18 (2): 127-142. https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-005X.00115.

Wrisley, Samantha Pinson. 2021. "Feminist Theory and the Problem of Misogyny." *Feminist Theory* 24 (2), 188–207. https://doi.org/10.1177/14647001211039365.

Dictionary Sources

@antagonistanbul. 2015. Instela, January 30, 2015. https://tr.instela.com/kadin---13760151.

@kuba ulku ocaklari. 2012. İnci Sözlük, March 10, 2012. http://www.incisozluk.com.tr/e/75594003/v.

@limon kimyon zorro. 2013. İnci Sözlük, February 7, 2013. http://www.incisozluk.com.tr/e/110089671/.

@navalboy. 2012. Instela, March 27, 2012. https://tr.instela.com/kadin---8590692.

@ocean ocean. 2013. Ekşi Sözlük, August 25, 2013. https://eksisozluk1923.com/entry/36383250.

@piremit. 2009. Uludağ Sözlük, January 4, 2009. https://www.uludagsozluk.

com/e/4468873/.

@prensipleriolanadam. 2015. Uludağ Sözlük, December 29, 2015. https://www.uludagsozluk.com/e/30734527/.

@quoth the raven acid. 2016. Instela, January 30, 2016. https://tr.instela.com/kadin---15013926.

@turtelscanfly. 2013. Instela, May 8, 2013. https://tr.instela.com/kadin---10538859.